Application: DR-2018-30 – 42 Earle Road - Preservation Determination

Subject Property: 42 Earle Road (Assessor's Parcel ID # 170-116)

Applicant: Lucy and Kevin Lynch Property Owner: Lucy and Kevin Lynch

Date: Report prepared 6/29/2018 for 7/9/2018 Historical Commission

Meeting

Staff Contact: Claudia Zarazua, Planner

Staff Recommendation: Preferably Preserved

APPLICATION OVERVIEW

Applications for Eligibility Notice and Preservation Determination were submitted on June 1, 2018 indicating the intent to demolish, in its entirety, a building located on the property and used as a dwelling. An Eligibility Notice was issued on June 4, 2018 determining the subject building to be an Eligible Building. The application was amended on June 28, 2018 to reflect a change in ownership. A public hearing before the Historical Commission was scheduled for July 9, 2018.

DESCRIPTION

In consideration of the application for Eligibility Notice, it was determined that the building used as a dwelling was not built prior to October 17, 1947, the date on which building permit "No. 9315-16" for a "dwelling and garage" was issued. The building permit was issued to Clark Realty Trust, comprised of local developer Antonio Epifano. According to an article from June 20, 1985 in the Townsman, Earle Road was named after the son of Fred Martin, part of the Fells Estate Trust, a local developer comprised of Fred Martin and his brother William.



Figure 1 Neighborhood Context



Figure 2 Earle Road and Pilgrim Road Plan. Courtesy of Norfolk County Registry of Deeds

The dwelling was built by Antonio Epifano in 1947. It was later sold to Lawrence and Eva Petersen in 1948. Mr. Petersen was the general traffic manager of Eastern Gas and Fuel Associates and Mrs. Petersen was an active member of the Wellesley Hills Congregational Church Woman's Association. According to the Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, the property was then sold to Mr. Petersen's great-granddaughter, Melissa Weinand, and her husband, Frank Weinand, in 1989. The property was then sold to James Jones and Lise Boutiette in 1990. Mr. Jones is a former banker and finance instructor at Babson College and Mrs. Boutiette is a financial advisor. The property was recently acquired by Lucy and Kevin Lynch.

According to the Wellesley building permit database, aside from the original permit, only electrical and plumbing permits have been issued for this address.

The dwelling is a two-story side-gabled house with wood siding on the second story and a car one-garage. It has a second story overhang and a masonry-veneered first story characteristic of the Colonial Revival style. Staff believes the original architecture of the house is best characterized as part of the Colonial Revival family with minimal modifications.

PRESERVATION DETERMINATION STANDARDS

In consideration of a Preservation Determination for the building, the Historical Commission is to determine whether or not the building should be Preferably Preserved, a term defined as building "the demolition of which that is proposed...would be detrimental to the historical or architectural heritage of the Town because such Building is (i) importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the

architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the Town, the Commonwealth of Massachusetts or the United States of America, (ii) historically or architecturally important by reason of period, style, method of building construction or association with a particular architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of Buildings, or (iii) located within one hundred fifty (150) feet of the boundary line of any federal or local historic district and contextually similar to the Buildings located in the adjacent federal or local historic district."

If the Commission determines that the Building should be Preferably Preserved, then no Demolition Permit with respect to such Building shall be issued until twelve (12) months after the date of the Preservation Determination.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff is of the opinion that the subject building is <u>not</u> (i) associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the Town, the Commonwealth of Massachusetts or the United States of America, or (iii) located within one hundred fifty (150) feet of the boundary line of any federal or local historic district and contextually similar to the Buildings located in the adjacent federal or local historic district, but **is** (ii) historically or architecturally important by reason of period, style, method of building construction or association with a particular architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of Buildings.

With respect to standard (ii), Staff believes that the publically visible facades of the dwelling are original in their form, and the dwelling is consistent with the period and style of the majority of the homes in the immediate neighborhood. While perhaps less architecturally important by itself, Staff is of the opinion that the dwelling is architecturally important in the context of the neighborhood.

Therefore, based upon the above, <u>Staff is of the opinion that demolition of the subject building would be detrimental to the historical or architectural heritage of the Town and recommends that the Historical Commission determine that the <u>building be deemed Preferably Preserved.</u></u>